



---

# A Conceptual Review of Learning Resources on Whole Language Teaching in Elementary Schools

---

Ferril Irham Muzaki\*

*\*Department of Elementary Education, Faculty of Education Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia*

*Corresponding Email: [\\*ferril.irham.fip@um.ac.id](mailto:ferril.irham.fip@um.ac.id)*

**Received:** 20 February 2023

**Accepted:** 08 April 2023

**Published:** 24 May 2023

**Abstract:** *Whole language teaching is a method of language instruction that emphasizes the use of language in everyday situations. The method that is used is library research, by searching and analyzing research results from published works in reputable journals. This methodology seeks to help students improve their language abilities while gaining an extraordinary and meaningful understanding of various subjects. In whole language instruction, (1) students learn to read, write, communicate, and listen through direct experience in daily life, as well as by perusing materials that are both meaningful and contextual. (2) Meaningful reading materials, such as novels, manuals, and articles, can be effective learning resources in whole language instruction. Contextually, meaningful reading material will aid students in acquiring a deeper comprehension of the language. (3) a conducive learning environment Attractive classrooms, audiovisual equipment, and engaging activities can help students feel more motivated and interested in learning languages on their own. In whole language instruction, technology such as computers, tablets, and smartphones can be used to enhance students' learning experiences. In elementary academies, integrated language teaching refers to a method that integrates language instruction with other subjects, such as mathematics, science, social studies, and sculpture studies. In conclusion, whole language teaching refer to integrated learning, by mash up learning materials, teaching materials and teaching methods in particular context.*

**Keywords:** *Language Instruction, Integrated Language, Whole Language, Language Creativity, and Meaningful Learning.*

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Whole language instruction emphasises students' ability to communicate in realistic situations. Thus, language education centred on a topic may benefit from full-language instruction across all curricular components. Whole language education aims to improve children's reading, writing, speaking, and listening, according to Fauzan (2022). If given the chance to engage in



meaningful activities and study materials, children may be prepared for the world they will live in. Elboshi (2021) suggests using novels, textbooks, and articles to improve complete language instruction. Read articles, textbooks, or novels. Reading real literature by real people may help students read more fluently. actual individuals wrote books. The learning environment directly affects a student's interest and motivation to learn a language. The student's passion for learning a new language also affects the educational environment. Salehi and colleagues (2014) found that using computers, tablets, and cellphones in the classroom may increase language acquisition.

Indonesian elementary schools employ "Integrated Language Teaching" to teach. Language skills—reading, writing, listening, and speaking—are taught alongside academic subjects in this kind of education. (Salehi et al., 2014) aims to help students improve their language skills and topic knowledge. The Indonesian Basic School uses several resources to provide its pupils a well-rounded Indonesian language education. Internet (1), Internet (2), Internet (3), and textbooks (4) are resources. Degirmenci (203), Indonesian textbooks used in "integrated" curricula generally incorporate both the academic information and the language abilities needed to understand it. Unlike texts not used in a "integrated" curriculum. Students may improve their language and topic knowledge by reading this book, which will help them understand the current situation. Recordings, films, and presentations may improve a student's education. This might improve student instruction. Integrated language education helps students learn and practise the target language by listening to and watching it being used in real-life situations. The Internet gives us access to a wealth of previously unavailable information. This was different before. Online tools may augment multilingual classroom teaching. E-books, websites, blogs, and digital learning platforms are examples.

This refers to Paidican and Arredondo (2022)'s work. Integrating language education into the curriculum might employ learning resources in languages other than the target language. Marsakha and Hariri (2021), Mortazavi et al (2021), and Paidican and Arredondo (2022) have shown that social interaction may improve learning. Other researchers concur. According to Paidican and Arredondo (2022), giving students opportunities to speak the target language throughout class is the best strategy to help them learn it. Thus, teachers should encourage students to speak the target language during lessons. Elementary school students have a wide range of instructional resources to help them learn the target language and the topic being taught. These tools help students learn the target language and subject matter. Teachers should choose classroom-appropriate books and films. Instructors do this.

Collaborating on English-learning projects may improve students' English skills. This might provide students more educational possibilities. Takaloo et al (2017) state that class conversation is one of the most essential variables in students' learning of textbook information. This starts the process. Comprehensive language students work together on projects, presentations, and language-related interactions. Gilakjani and Sabouri (2017) suggest using literature and the family environment to teach English as a second language. Talking to family, friends, and neighbours may help language learners. Whole language training allows students to learn a new language through a range of learning tools. Students may learn a new language and improve their language skills. Language lessons may help attain this objective. This popular approach makes learning a new language fun and effective to utilise.



## **2. METHOD**

The literature is used to define whole language education in elementary institutions (Mortazavi et al., 2021; Turgut & Aslan, 2021; Wurth et al., 2019; Zein et al., 2020). Baker (2019), Fitriansyah et al. (2020), Ismiyati et al. (2021), and Ürün (2015). This study identifies three categories that influence whole language instruction priorities. The fundamental concept is supported by readily available learning materials. This course covers resilience, gratitude, and self-efficacy. The second idea uses three whole language education principles: utilising a mind map to visualise the problem, analysing it, and prioritising the best answers. Lessons are taught using the third principle, which integrates the two preceding concepts as well as three additional sub-principles: (1) instructional design, (2) instructional models, and (3) instructional procedures. This method aims to provide a framework for organising library resources in accordance with different pedagogical principles (Hasanah, 2020; Marsakha & Hariri, 2021; Miller et al., 2021; Wurth et al., 2019; Yeslyurt, 2021).

## **3. RESULTS**

### **Teaching Resources**

Teaching materials or learning materials include textbooks, articles, storybooks, and other media used in the learning process (Astari et al., 2022; Butler, 2015; Rahman et al., 2019; Zein et al., 2020). Accurate and pertinent learning materials are crucial to the whole language teaching approach because they enable students to acquire a comprehensive understanding of the language, including cultural, contextual, and linguistic knowledge (Deng & Yu, 2022; Zulaikha et al., 2021; Hasanah, 2020; Ürün, 2015). Additionally, engaging and diverse learning materials can inspire students to learn a language more actively and increase their language creativity.

### **Resilience Concept**

Resilience refers to a person's capacity to overcome obstacles or hardship in their lives. Whole language is an approach to language acquisition that emphasises reading, writing, speaking, and listening, among other skills (Deng & Yu, 2022; Zulaikha et al., 2021; Hasanah, 2020; Ürün, 2015). The relationship between resilience and the development of a whole language in primary school is that the whole language approach can assist in enhancing students' resilience. Alam & Yao (2019); Ismiyati et al. (2021); Miller et al. (2021).

The whole language approach also values individuality and enables students to develop self-confidence and trust in their language comprehension skills. This can aid students in developing a positive self-image and bolster their self-assurance as they face challenges and difficulties in life. Thus, the development of a whole language in primary education can increase students' resilience and enable them to surmount life's challenges and difficulties (Alam & Yao, 2019; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Miller et al., 2022).

### **Teaching Models**

The learning model is the approach or strategy used to facilitate the learning process and enhance students' comprehension of the studied material. Cooperative learning models, project-



based learning models, and inquiry learning models are examples of commonly used learning models (Astari et al., 2022; Baker, 2019; Fitriansyah et al., 2020; Sani, Komang Andri et al., 2021). The relationship between teaching models and whole-language instruction is that the whole-language approach can utilise a variety of effective learning models to accomplish effective learning objectives. In this approach, the learning model must be tailored to the needs and abilities of students and allow for the most effective learning (Gabillon & Ailincal, 2015; Grzelka, 2020; James & Cobanoglu, 2018; Ürün, 2015; Zein et al., 2020). The whole language approach also necessitates the use of a learning model that enables students to actively and effectively interact with the language. Thus, there is a close relationship between instructional paradigms and whole language instruction. The key to attaining effective and efficient learning objectives in the whole language teaching approach is an accurate and effective learning model (Astari et al., 2022; Fitriansyah et al., 2020; Yeslyurt, 202).

### **Teaching Methodologies**

The term "learning steps" refers to a series of phases designed to help pupils comprehend the material more thoroughly and efficiently. In general, the learning steps include the phases of introduction, exploration, comprehension, and evaluation. The relationship between learning steps and whole-language teaching is that the whole-language approach requires the application of the appropriate learning steps to achieve effective learning goals (Alam & Yao, 2019; Astari et al., 2022; Habiburrahim, 2019; Noroozi et al., 2020; Sani, Komang Andri et al., 2022). Learning phases in the whole language approach should be founded on a comprehension of how pupils acquire and develop language. The whole language approach also necessitates learning steps that facilitate the most effective and efficient learning for students. This involves the introduction of concepts and learning materials in an engaging and diversified manner, as well as the active and interactive exploration and comprehension of learning materials. In addition, effective learning measures should consider student progress and adapt learning strategies to each student's unique requirements and abilities. This will enhance students' ability to comprehend and master the language, as well as their communication skills. Thus, there is a close relationship between learning phases and whole language instruction. Good and efficient learning steps are the key to accomplishing effective and efficient learning objectives in the whole language teaching approach (Deng & Yu, 2022; Zulaikha et al., 2021; Gilakjani, 2017; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Papa & Jackson, 2021).

## **4. DISCUSSION**

### **Teaching Strategies in Elementary Schools**

Resilience is the capacity to recover from adversity or failure. In the context of education, resilience can assist students in overcoming learning obstacles and emotions of despair. When confronted with difficulties in learning, resilient students can maintain their motivation to learn and do not give up easily (Deng & Yu, 2022; Zulaikha et al., 2021; Gilakjani, 2017; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Papa & Jackson, 2021). Character Education Character education is an educational approach that teaches moral values, such as honesty, responsibility, and empathy. The goal of character education is to cultivate students who are not only academically intelligent but also possess exemplary character. Character education can help students become responsible



individuals who respect others and have a positive learning attitude (Fitriansyah et al., 2020; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Rahman et al., 2019; Ürün, 2015).

The relationship between the three concepts is explained below (Gilakjani, 2017; Habiburrahim, 2019; Papa & Jackson, 2021; Zhang et al., 2022). Self-efficacy is a psychological concept that alludes to a person's confidence in his capacity to perform a task or attain a certain objective. Students with a high level of self-efficacy are typically more motivated to complete tasks and more capable of overcoming obstacles during the learning process.

Teaching materials consist of everything used by educators to aid in student learning. Good instructional materials can enhance student comprehension of concepts and participation in learning (Zhang et al., 2021). In the context of self-efficacy development, high-quality instructional materials can help students feel more capable of tackling academic challenges. (Habiburrahim, 2019) Teaching materials that are well-designed can help students develop a firm understanding and the skills necessary for learning success. Integrity, empathy, honesty, and responsibility are some of the moral values that are taught through character education. The goal of character education is to cultivate students who are not only academically intelligent but also possess exemplary character.

Character education can help students develop the attitudes and skills necessary for academic and life success (Deng & Yu, 2022). Well-designed instructional materials can help students feel more confident when confronting academic tasks and challenges. Self-efficacy can be an essential factor in student success, and the use of high-quality instructional materials and character education can assist students in enhancing their self-efficacy and achieving greater academic and life success.

### **Ideas in Language Teaching**

Mind mapping issues, language creativity, and character education in elementary school are three interconnected concepts within the context of elementary school learning. Mind mapping problem is a visual technique used to map problems or challenges and generate creative and innovative solutions. This technique employs diagrams and images to visualise the problem and connect ideas related to it (Noroozi et al., 2020). Mind mapping problems, language creativity, and character education can be combined to help students reach their maximum potential.

In the process of acquiring a second language, character education and communicating creativity are interconnected. Character education refers to the teaching of moral and ethical values, such as honesty, tolerance, responsibility, cooperation, and discipline, to students in order to develop good character. While language creativity refers to students' ability to communicate and convey themselves in a creative and innovative manner (Miller et al., 2021). Baker (2019) identifies one of the challenges of integrating character education and creativity in language learning as ensuring that students not only comprehend moral and ethical concepts but can also employ them in daily life. In order for students to simultaneously develop language skills, character, and creativity, there is a need for a comprehensive and integrated approach in language instruction.

Integrating character education and creativity into language learning can be accomplished through the use of certain strategies. Using active and imaginative methods of instruction, such



as group discussions, collaborative projects, and drama. This method enables students to interact actively with the language and its context and also promotes creativity and collaboration in the learning process (Gabillon & Ailincal, 2015). Emphasising character values in the context of language, such as truthfulness in speech, tolerance in listening to the opinions of others, and responsibility in language use. This can be accomplished through discussions and exercises centred on character values pertinent to language use (Ismiyati et al., 2021).

Provide students with creative assignments that enable them to freely express themselves through language, such as writing stories, poems, or film scripts. Such assignments can foster creativity and broaden students' language skills. Utilising technology and new media such as videos, audio, and social media to foster innovative and inventive language learning. This technology and media make learning and communicating more engaging and interactive for students. (Astari et al., 2022). This can be accomplished through the provision of challenges or language activities that encourage the use of inventive and original language.

By integrating creativity and character education into language learning, students can develop superior language skills, a stronger character, and a more developed sense of creativity. This can help pupils become better people who are better prepared to confront the challenges of a world that is increasingly complex and dynamic. Character education in the context of education can help students develop a strong character and be prepared for future challenges (Fitriansyah et al., 2020).

The three are interconnected because language creativity can help students develop creative and innovative problem-solving skills, which are crucial to the process. (Sani, Komang Andri, et al., 2021) In the process of finding solutions, students must develop creativity in order to find effective solutions that can be employed in ordinary life. In addition, character education can assist students in developing moral and ethical values that are essential to the process of problem-solving, such as honesty, responsibility, and cooperation. By incorporating language creativity, problem-solving, and character education into the learning process, students can cultivate holistic skills and character and be prepared for future challenges. This can help students become better people who can positively contribute to society (Butler, 2015).

### **Teaching Techniques in Indonesian Elementary Schools**

Teaching method, learning design, and character education are three aspects of the learning process that are interconnected. Here is a description of the relationship between the three items. Teaching method refers to the manner in which instructors instruct their students. There are numerous methods of instruction available, including lectures, discussions, simulations, and problem-based learning. (Zein et al., 2020) Teaching methods are utilised to facilitate a more effective and efficient learning process.

Learning design is the planning of structured and systematic learning, including learning objectives, instructional strategies, evaluation, and teaching materials. (Rahman et al., 2019)

Learning design requires instructors to consider student requirements, student characteristics, and instructional strategies. Character education refers to teaching pupils moral and ethical values, such as honesty, tolerance, responsibility, cooperation, and discipline, in order to form a decent character. The purpose of character education is to develop pupils with strong character who are prepared to face future challenges.



(Turgut & Aslan, 2021) Learning design and teaching methods can assist instructors in incorporating moral and ethical values into the learning process. (Ürün, 2015) Teachers can plan learning that imparts moral and ethical values by employing appropriate teaching methods. On the other hand, character education can impact the learning design and instructional method selected by the instructor. For instance, if the primary goal of education is to instill the value of honesty, then teachers can select instructional strategies that enable students to develop honesty skills, such as discussions and case studies.

By integrating teaching methods, learning design, and character education into the learning process, teachers can assist students in the development of holistic skills and character and prepare them for future challenges (Hasanah, 2020). This can help students become better people who can positively contribute to society (Wurth et al., 2019). Methods and models of learning are two crucial components of the learning process. The term "learning method" refers to the method or strategy employed by instructors to instruct students. The learning model, meanwhile, is a conceptual framework or pattern that organises and directs the learning process. Strengthening character education is a learning process that seeks to shape the students' character so that they become decent and responsible members of society. The process of teaching students moral and ethical values is essential to enhancing character education. The relationship between learning methods, learning models, and the improvement of character education rests in the integration of these three aspects into an effective and efficient learning process. In holistic learning, character education should be bolstered using the most appropriate learning methodologies and models. For instance, if the learning model employed is cooperative learning, then group discussion and collaborative learning are the appropriate learning strategies. Teachers can incorporate character education into the learning process by imparting moral and ethical values such as cooperation, mutual respect, and problem-solving together (Yacob & Yunus, 2019).

The connection between learning methods, learning models, and the enhancement of character education enables students to comprehend the relevance of subject matter to real-world situations. This can help students develop a strong character and prepare them for future challenges (Bacon, 2017; Hasanah, 2020; Takaloo et al., 2017; Mortazavi et al., 2021; Paidican & Arredondo, 2022; Rahman et al., 2019; Wurth et al., 2019). On the other hand, a lack of emphasis on character education can result in students who are only able to master the subject matter technically, but lack the moral and ethical values necessary to be decent and responsible individuals (Marsakha & Hariri, 2021). The term "learning procedure" refers to a series of actions and measures performed by the instructor to implement learning. While learning methods are strategies used by instructors to instruct and engage students in the learning process, learning is the process itself. Strengthening character education is an endeavour to shape the character of students through the teaching of moral and ethical values (Bacon, 2017). In an effective learning process, the three elements are interconnected (Bettini & Park, 2021). Teachers must take into account the characteristics of their pupils and the subject matter being taught when developing an effective learning procedure. Alam & Yao, 2019; Bacon, 2017; Butler, 2015; Degirmenci, 2021; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Mortazavi et al., 2021; Paidican & Arredondo, 2022; Rahman et al., 2019; Turgut & Aslan, 2021; Wurth et al., 2019; Yeslyurt, 2021). In addition, learning procedures and methods should be bolstered to promote character education (Wang, 2020). Teachers can infuse moral and ethical principles into their lessons



and provide students with life-relevant examples. This will aid students in comprehending and applying these values in daily life. For instance, if the teacher uses the group discussion learning method in the learning procedure, the teacher can integrate character education by assigning cooperative and respectful group tasks (Mortazavi et al., 2021; Turgut & Aslan, 2021; Wurth et al., 2019; Zein et al., 2020). Throughout the group discussion, the instructor can provide feedback and emphasise values such as honesty, responsibility, and tolerance (Bacon, 2017; Ismiyati et al., 2021; Mortazavi et al., 2021; Turgut & Aslan, 2021; Wurth et al., 2019; Yeslyurt, 2021). By integrating learning procedures and learning methods, as well as bolstering character education, students will be more engaged in the learning process and comprehend the moral and ethical values required in daily life. This will assist students in becoming responsible individuals with moral and ethical problem-solving skills (Liang et al., 2021). Thus, it needs to be solved by integrating teaching materials, teaching methods and teaching strategies in elementary school classrooms. It means, it is an obligation to create research data based on students performance in elementary school classrooms.

## **5. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION**

### **Conclusions**

In the implementation of elementary school language curriculum, there are a few problematic areas in language instruction. The primary issue is the capacity to provide equal educational facilities. The second issue is the preparation of qualified elementary school instructors to teach integrated learning. The third issue concerns the creation of instructional materials by certified teachers. Consequently, the difficulties in providing elementary teachers with master's or doctoral degrees in education become effective in educating teachers with master's or doctoral degrees. Consequently, the establishment of facilities becomes problematic when analyzing chronological factors in language instruction. Several factors facilitate the creation of language instructional materials.

### **Suggestion**

The most important aspect of language instruction regarding language creativity is creating language acquisition orders. The following issue relates to whole language instruction in elementary education and the growth of academic research materials. Creating whole language instructional materials near to the education of material development is an additional challenge. The educational foundation does not align with the ministry of education and culture's goals. Among the factors that must be developed is the mitigation of the negative effects of digitalization. Several factors had an adverse effect on digitalization. Smartphone fixation is related to digital transformation. Additionally, it is widely believed that game addiction is a side consequence of digitalization. There are numerous issues associated with signal potency in terms of linguistic originality. Creativity is also essential when developing language instructional materials. Multiple factors make whole language instruction problematic. The variables involved in the creation of language-learning materials. Integrated with the development of language learning materials are the learning resources of language instruction. Those are creative approaches to establishing language-learning facilities in outlying elementary institutions.



### **Declaration of Financial Support and Conflict of Interest**

The authors did not receive support or become a member from any organization for the submitted work.

### **6. REFERENCES**

1. Alam, S., & Yao, N. (2019). Big Data Analytics, Text Mining and Modern English Language. *Journal of Grid Computing*, 17(2), 357–366. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10723-018-9452-4>
2. Astari, R., Mukhlis, A., & Faturrahman, M. I. (2022). CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF THE NEWS OF COVID-19 CORPSE SNATCHING PATIENT IN THE I-NEWS. *LINGUA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 16(2), 175–186. <https://doi.org/10.18860/ling.v16i2.12118>
3. Bacon, C. K. (2017). Multilanguage, Multipurpose: A Literature Review, Synthesis, and Framework for Critical Literacies in English Language Teaching. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 49(3), 424–453. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1086296X17718324>
4. Baker, L. (2019). Community-Based Service-Learning in Language Education: A Review of the Literature. *International Journal of Research on Service-Learning and Community Engagement*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/10.37333/001c.11480>
5. Bettini, E., & Park, Y. (2021). Novice Teachers' Experiences in High-Poverty Schools: An Integrative Literature Review. *Urban Education*, 56(1), 3–31. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085916685763>
6. Butler, Y. G. (2015). English language education among young learners in East Asia: A review of current research (2004–2014). *Language Teaching*, 48(3), 303–342. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444815000105>
7. Degirmenci, R. (2021). The Use of Quizizz in Language Learning and Teaching from the Teachers' and Students' Perspectives: A Literature Review. 1(1).
8. Deng, X., & Yu, Z. (2022). A Systematic Review of Machine-Translation-Assisted Language Learning for Sustainable Education. *Sustainability*, 14(13), 7598. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14137598>
9. Elboshi, A. (2021). Web-Enhanced Peer Feedback in ESL Writing Classrooms A Literature Review. *English Language Teaching*, 14(4), 66. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v14n4p66>
10. Fauzan, U. (2022). A Critical Discourse Analysis of Policy Texts and Media Narratives of COVID-19 Vaccine in Indonesia. 12.
11. Fitriansyah, R., Fatinah, L., & Syahril, M. (2020). Critical Review: Professional Development Programs to Face Open Educational Resources in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal on Learning and Advanced Education (IJOLAE)*, 2(2), 109–119. <https://doi.org/10.23917/ijolae.v2i2.9662>
12. Zulaikha, Z.F, Hariri, H., Rini, R., Sowiyah, S., & Faculty of Teacher Training and Education (2021). Analysis of vocational education curriculum in ASEAN Economic Community: A literature review. *Journal of Social, Humanity, and Education*, 1(3), 157–170. <https://doi.org/10.35912/jshe.v1i3.357>



13. Gabillon, Z., & Ailincal, R. (2015). Content and Language Integrated Learning: In Search of a Coherent Conceptual Framework.
14. Gilakjani, A. P. (2017). A Review of the Literature on the Integration of Technology into the Learning and Teaching of English Language Skills. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 7(5), 95. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ijel.v7n5p95>
15. Gilakjani, A. P., & Sabouri, N. B. (2017). Teachers' Beliefs in English Language Teaching and Learning: A Review of the Literature. *English Language Teaching*, 10(4), 78. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n4p78>
16. Grzelka, M. (2020). ATTITUDES TOWARD VULNERABLE POPULATIONS IN THE TIME OF COVID-19: CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF GAZETA.PL ONLINE COMMENT SECTIONS. *Society Register*, 4(2), 121–132. <https://doi.org/10.14746/sr.2020.4.2.09>
17. Habiburrahim, H. (2019). A REVIEW OF THE DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT. *Englisia Journal*, 6(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.22373/ej.v6i1.3529>
18. Hasanah, U. (2020). Key Definitions of STEM Education: Literature Review. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Environmental and Science Education*, 16(3), e2217. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ijese/8336>
19. Ismiyati, I., Nurlatifasari, R., & Sumarlam, S. (2021). Coronavirus in News Text: Critical Discourse Analysis Detik.Com News Portal. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics*, 6(1), 195. <https://doi.org/10.21462/jeltl.v6i1.517>
20. James, W. B., & Cobanoglu, C. (2018). *Advances in Global Education and Research: Volume 2. 2.*
21. Liang, J.-C., Hwang, G.-J., Chen, M.-R. A., & Darmawansah, D. (2021). Roles and research foci of artificial intelligence in language education: An integrated bibliographic analysis and systematic review approach. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 1–27. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2021.1958348>
22. Marsakha, A. T., & Hariri, H. (2021). Management of Character Education in School: A Literature Review. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 8(2).
23. Miller, J. A., Sivaramakrishnan, R., Tao, Y., Goldsmith, C. F., Burke, M. P., Jasper, A. W., Hansen, N., Labbe, N. J., Glarborg, P., & Zádor, J. (2021). Combustion chemistry in the twenty-first century: Developing theory-informed chemical kinetics models. *Progress in Energy and Combustion Science*, 83, 100886. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pecs.2020.100886>
24. Takaloo, N.M, English Literature Department, Payame Noor University, Tehran, Iran, Ahmadi, M. R., & English Language Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. (2017). The Effect of Learners' Motivation on Their Reading Comprehension Skill: A Literature Review. *International Journal of Research in English Education*, 2(3), 10–21. <https://doi.org/10.18869/acadpub.ijree.2.3.10>
25. Mortazavi, M., Nasution, M. K. M., Abdolazadeh, F., Behroozi, M., & Davarpanah, A. (2021). Sustainable Learning Environment by Mobile-Assisted Language Learning Methods on the Improvement of Productive and Receptive Foreign Language Skills: A Comparative Study for Asian Universities. *Sustainability*, 13(11), 6328. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13116328>



26. Noroozi, O., Dehghanzadeh, H., & Talaei, E. (2020). A systematic review on the impacts of game-based learning on argumentation skills. *Entertainment Computing*, 35, 100369. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.entcom.2020.100369>
27. Paidican, M. A., & Arredondo, P. A. (2022). The Technological-Pedagogical Knowledge for In-Service Teachers in Primary Education: A Systematic Literature Review. *Contemporary Educational Technology*, 14(3), ep370. <https://doi.org/10.30935/cedtech/11813>
28. Papa, R., & Jackson, K. M. (2021). Artificial Intelligence and Computer Design. In R. Papa & K. Moran Jackson (Eds.), *Artificial Intelligence, Human Agency and the Educational Leader* (pp. 33–67). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-77610-7\\_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-77610-7_2)
29. Rahman, M. M., Islam, M. S., Karim, A., Chowdhury, T. A., Rahman, M. M., Seraj, P. M. I., & Singh, M. K. M. (2019). English language teaching in Bangladesh today: Issues, outcomes and implications. *Language Testing in Asia*, 9(1), 9. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40468-019-0085-8>
30. Salehi, H., Shojaei, M., & Sattar, S. (2014). Using E-Learning and ICT Courses in Educational Environment: A Review. *English Language Teaching*, 8(1), p63. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v8n1p63>
31. Sani, Komang Andri, Budiarsa, Made, Laksana, I Ketut Darma, & Simpen, I Wayan. (2021). Discourse Structure of Covid 19 Edition Cartoon: Critical Discourse Analysis. <https://doi.org/10.5281/ZENODO.4474803>
32. Yacob, N. Syafiqah, & Md Yunus, M. (2019). Language Games in Teaching and Learning English Grammar: A Literature Review. *Arab World English Journal*, 10(1), 209–217. <https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol10no1.18>
33. Turgut, Y. E., & Aslan, A. (2021). Factors affecting ICT integration in TURKISH education: A systematic review. *Education and Information Technologies*, 26(4), 4069–4092. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-021-10441-2>
34. Ürün, M. F. (2015). Integration of Technology into Language Teaching: A Comparative Review Study. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 7(1), 76. <https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0701.09>
35. Wang, S. (2020). Project-based Language Learning in China: A Literature Review. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 11(1), 66. <https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.1101.08>
36. Wurth, J. G. R., Tigelaar, E. H., Hulshof, H., De Jong, J. C., & Admiraal, W. F. (2019). Key elements of L1-oral language teaching and learning in secondary education. A literature review. *L1 Educational Studies in Language and Literature*, 19, Running Issue(Running Issue), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.17239/L1ESLL-2019.19.01.15>
37. Zein, S., Sukyadi, D., Hamied, F. A., & Lengkanawati, N. S. (2020). English language education in Indonesia: A review of research (2011–2019). *Language Teaching*, 53(4), 491–523. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444820000208>
38. Zhang, Y., Lucas, M., & Pedro, L. (2022). A Decade of Short Videos for Foreign Language Teaching and Learning: A Review. *Education Sciences*, 12(11), 786. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci12110786>